Replies to questions furnished by Government—Position of—

ಶ್ರೀ ಜಿ. ರಾಮೇಗೌಡ (ದೊಡ್ಡಬಳ್ಳಾಪುರ):—ಸ್ವಾಮಿ, ನನ್ನ ಪ್ರಶ್ನೆ ಕಳುಹಿಸಿ ಎರಡು ತಿಂಗಳು ಆಯಿತು. ಒಂದಕ್ಕೂ ಉತ್ತರ ಬರಲಿಲ್ಲ. ಸರ್ಕಾರಕ್ಕೆ ಉತ್ತರ ಕೊಡಲು ಶಕ್ತಿ ಇದೆಯೋ ಇಲ್ಲವೋ ? ಅಥವಾ ತಾವೇ ಒತ್ತಾಯ ಮಾಡಲಿಲ್ಲವೋ, ದಯವಿಟ್ಟು ತಿಳಿಸಬೇಕು.

Mr. SPEAKER.—So far as the position regarding furnishing replies to questions by Government is concerned, it is fairly comfortable. There is much improvement. I think as it is, 80 to 90 per cent of the questions have been replied. Our request to Government to expedite replies has been very much respected. If the hon. Member gives me his question numbers, I shall find out.

ಶ್ರೀ ಕೆ. ಪ್ರಭಾಕರ.—ನಾನು ಪ್ರಶ್ನೆಯನ್ನು ಕಳುಹಿಸಿ ಎರಡು ತಿಂಗಳಾಯಿತು. ಅದರ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ಏನಾಯಿತು, ಸ್ವಾಮಿ ?

ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರು.—ತಾವು ಕೇಳುತ್ತಿರುವ ಫೈಲು ನನ್ನ ಹತ್ತಿರ ಇಲ್ಲ, ಅದರ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ನನ್ನ ಛೇಂಬರಿಗೆ ಬಂದು ಮಾತನಾಡಬಹುದು.

Murder of a Village Panchayet Chairman

ಶ್ರೀ ವಿ. ಎನ್. ಪಾಟೀಲ್.—ಸ್ವಾಮಿ, ನಾನು ಹೇಳುವುದು ನಮ್ಮ ಬಿದರೆ ಡಿಸ್ಟ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್‌ನಲ್ಲಿ ಒಬ್ಬ ವಿಲೇಜ್ ಪಂಚಾಯಿತ್ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರನ್ನು ಕೊಲೆ ಮಾಡಿ ಆ ಹೆಣವನ್ನು ಸುಟ್ಟು ಹಾಕಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ನಾನು ಒಂದು ಕಾರ್ ಅಟೆನ್‌ಷನ್ ಮೋಷನ್ ಕಳುಹಿಸಿದ್ದೆ ಮತ್ತು ಅಡ್ಜರ್ನ್‌ಮೆಂಟ್ ಮೋಷನ್ ಕೂಡ ಕಳುಹಿಸಿದ್ದೆ. 18 ದಿವಸದ ಹಿಂದೆ ಅಲ್ಲಿ ಪೋಲೀಸಿನವರ ಜಿದ್ದಾಜಿದ್ದಿನಿಂದ ಹಗಲು 11 ಗಂಟೆ ಸಮಯದಲ್ಲಿ ಆತನನ್ನು ಕೊಲೆಮಾಡಿ ಸುಟ್ಟಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಇಂತಹ ಅನ್ಯಾಯ ನಡೆದಿರುವುದನ್ನು ಪೋಲೀಸ್ ಡಿಪಾರ್ಟ್‌ಮೆಂಟ್‌ಗೆ ತಿಳಿಸಿದರೂ ಕೂಡ ದುರ್ದೈವವಶಾತ್ ಅದನ್ನು ರಿಜೆಕ್ಟ್ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ದಯವಿಟ್ಟು ಇದಕ್ಕೆ ಉತ್ತರ ತಿಳಿಸಬೇಕು.

Mr. SPEAKER.—This is not the place to make such requests. The hon. Member may come to my chambers. I shall look into it.

Sri G. CHANDRAKANTH.—I appeal to the Chair to re-consider and admit the said calling attention notice. I appeal to you that it is a very important matter where police excesses have taken place and a man has been burnt alive.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—It is a very important matter and therefore the Chair should reconsider it. When a citizen is burnt alive, it becomes a serious matter and therefore the Chair should admit the call attention notice.

Sri K. PRABHAKAR.—The Chair should view this question with human sympathy. Law and order question does not come in here.

Sri M. S. KRISHNAN.—I want the Chair to reconsider its decision.

Mr. SPEAKER.—It should be done at the proper place and not here.

Sri G. CHANDRAKANTH.—I have also gathered information that the Sub-Inspector who is working there, has been transferred to Bangalore. I understand that he had been there when this incident took place. People are suspecting that the Sub-Inspector is involved. in it.

Mr. SPEAKER.—I shall revise the ruling if he comes to my chambers. For the time being the notice is not allowed.

Sri AZEEZ SAIT.—You have to satisfy the House on an important matter like this.

Mr. SPEAKER.—I have taken the decision with a full sense of responsibility.

Sri AZEEZ SAIT.—You are the custodian of the rights of this House. The Chair should treat humanely the problems facing the House. When a man has been burnt alive, you have to be more considerable in such cases.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—Many members are appealing to you to reconsider your decision. What can we do if you are not sympathetic?

Mr. SPEAKER.—I am guided by the rules of this House.

Sri K. PRABHAKAR.—It is not an ordinary murder. It relates to a person carrying the office of the village Patel. ಇನ್‌ವೆಸ್ಟಿಗೇಷನ್‌ಗೆ ಅವಕಾಶ ಇಲ್ಲದಹಾಗೆ ಆತನ ದೇಹವನ್ನು ಸುಟ್ಟುಬಿಟ್ಟಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಇದಕ್ಕೆ ಸರ್ಕಾರದವರು ಸಕಾಲದಲ್ಲಿ ಸಮಜಾಯಿಷಿ ಕೊಡಬೇಕಾಗಿದೆ. ತಾವು ಸರಕಾರದವರು ಉತ್ತರ ಕೊಡದೆ ಇರುವಾಗ ಅವರಿಗೆ ರಕ್ಷಣೆ ಕೊಡುವುದು ಸರಿಯಲ್ಲ.

ಶ್ರೀ ಜಿ. ದುಗ್ಗಪ್ಪ.—ಮಾನ್ಯ ಸದಸ್ಯರು ಪರಿಸ್ಥಿತಿ ಎಷ್ಟು ಗಂಭೀರವಾಗಿದೆ ಜನರು ಯಾವ ರೀತಿ ಗಾಬರಿಯಾಗಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಎನ್ನುವುದನ್ನೆಲ್ಲಾ ಹೇಳಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಹೀಗಿರುವಾಗ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರು ಯಾತಕ್ಕೆ ಈ ವಿಷಯದಲ್ಲಿ ಅಷ್ಟು ಅಡಮಂಟಾಗಿದ್ದಾರೋ ನನಗೆ ಗೊತ್ತಿಲ್ಲ. ಸರಕಾರದವರು ಉತ್ತರ ಕೊಡಲು ಅವಕಾಶಮಾಡಿಕೊಟ್ಟರೆ, ಅದರಿಂದ ಯಾವ ತೊಂದರೆಯೂ ಆಗುವುದಿಲ್ಲ.

10-00 A.M.

Mr. SPEAKER.—If the hon. Member comes to my chambers, I shall look into the file and if he convinces me that there is a case I shall certainly consider. If the matter is to be raised here and the time is to be wasted like this, it is not good.

Sri V. N. PATIL.—I shall come to your chamber.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—The Chair has to trust the hon. Member. It is not such an easy matter; it is a matter concerning the death of a person. It is the question of burning of an individual alive. The Chair should not talk so lightheartedly.

Mr. SPEAKER.—If the hon, Member Sri V. N. Patil thinks that I should revise my decision I shall send for the file again and see. I have rejected the motion now. The matter cannot be taken up on the floor of the House.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—Would the Chair do it in a day?

Mr. SPEAKER.—I cannot promise. I shall look into the file, and decide the matter on merits.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—It is the question of life of a person; the Chair cannot take it so lightheartedly.

Mr. SPEAKER.—The hon. Member cannot hustle me into action

ಶ್ರೀ ಆರ್. ದಯಾನಂದಸಾಗರ್.—ದಬ್ಬಾಳಿಕೆ ಮಾಡಬೇಡಿ.

ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರು.—ನಾನು ಮಾಡುತ್ತಿಲ್ಲ. ನೀವು ಮಾಡುತ್ತಿದ್ದೀರಿ.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—Why are you trying to hide this matter ? Are you interested in it ?

Mr. SPEAKER.—The hon. Member is exhausting my patience.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—I am prepared for the consequences, I am not made of base metal.

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY (Minister for Law, Labour and Parliamentary Affairs).—On a point of order, Sir.

Sri V. N. PATIL.—I shall come to your chamber, Sir. I have not the least intention to prolong this matter.

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY.—Sir, the hon. Member Sri Dayananda Sagar has been obstructing the proceedings.

Sri R. DAYANANDA SAGAR.—What does he mean by that ?

Sri K. PUTTASWAMY.—My point of order is that the Speaker must prevent this obstruction.

Sri H. SIDDAVEERAPPA.—Sir, I would like to say that I am not commenting on the point of order ; it is for you to give your ruling. What I would like to add is this : somehow we are feeling that in this House there is a lot of pressurisation going on. If that is the attitude then it becomes impossible for us to function as a democratic opposition. We have been seeing what is happening in the other Houses elsewhere in this country. I do not know whether they are egging us on to indulge in such things or lower down ourselves to that level. After all, if some hon. Members on this side have been expressing rather very ebulliently and vehemently that only shows the seriousness of the problem with which we are seized. Now it is for you to see that these things are taken up in the proper perspective and dealt with accordingly instead of saying, "You come to my chamber and so on." As we have been seeing, the Government is turning a deaf ear to these criticisms and there is no response from them. It is a very serious allegation, no matter from whatever quarters it comes. A dead body was burnt in order to efface evidence. That is a very serious offence. When such is the position it is the duty of the Home Minister to take these matters rather seriously. I was also in charge of the Home portfolio for some years. Whenever such things happened during my regime—hon. Members can take the proceedings in the legislature and see—we never took shelter under this or that pretext. We immediately got a report and made it available to the House, whenever it was sitting. In a democracy when public grievances are brought on a forum like this, it is up to you, Sir to give opportunities to Members in a proper manner. If you stick to the rule and if you become slave to the rules on all occasions, that won't take us far. Therefore, I request you to consider this matter and see that a proper atmosphere and climate is created.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎಸ್. ಶಿವಪ್ಪ.—ನಾನು ಹೇಳಿದ್ದನ್ನು ತಾವು ಮೊದಲೇ ಕೇಳಿದ್ದರೆ ಇಷ್ಟೊಂದು ರಾದ್ಧಾಂತವಾಗುತ್ತಿರಲಿಲ್ಲ. ಮಾನ್ಯ ಪಿ. ಎಸ್. ಪಾಟೀಲರು ತಂದಂಥ ಒಂದು ಕಾಲಿಂಗ್ ಅಟೆಕ್ಷನ್ ನೋಟೀಸನ್ನು ತಾವು ಡಿಸ್ ಅಲೋ ಮಾಡಲಾಗಿದೆ ಎಂದು ಹೇಳಿದಾಗ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಚಂದ್ರಕಾಂತ್ ಅವರು ಅಲ್ಲಿ ನಡೆದಿರುವ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಉದ್ವೇಗದಿಂದ ಹೇಳಿದರು. ಆಗ ತಾವು ಶ್ರೀ ಚಂದ್ರಕಾಂತ್ ಮತ್ತು ಶ್ರೀ ಪಾಟೀಲ್ ಅವರಿಬ್ಬರನ್ನೂ ಕೂಡ ತಮ್ಮ ಛೇಂಬರ್‌ಗೆ ಬಂದು ಮಾತನಾಡುವಂತೆ ಹೇಳಿದಿರಿ. ಅದಕ್ಕೆ ಅವರಿಬ್ಬರೂ ಕೂಡ ಒಪ್ಪಿಕೊಂಡರು. ಅವರು ಆ ಕೇಸ್ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ರುಜುವಾತು ಕೊಡುವುದಕ್ಕೆ ತಯಾರಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಮತ್ತು ಆ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ಸರ್ಕಾರದ ಮೇಲೂ ಕೂಡ ದೊಡ್ಡ ಜವಾಬ್ದಾರಿ ಇದೆ. ಅದನ್ನು ತಾವು ಕನ್ಸಿಡರ್ ಮಾಡಬೇಕಾಗುತ್ತದೆ. ಈ ಮಧ್ಯೆ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಪಾರ್ಲಿಮೆಂಟರಿ ಸಚಿವರು ಏನೋ ಹೇಳಿದ್ದರಿಂದ ಸಭೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಗದ್ದಲ ಉಂಟಾಯಿತು. ಶ್ರೀ ದಯಾನಂದ ಸಾಗರ್ ಅವರ ಧ್ವನಿ ಸ್ವಲ್ಪ ದೊಡ್ಡದು. ಅವರು ಮೆಲ್ಲಗೆ ಮಾತನಾಡಿದರೂ ಕೂಡ ದೊಡ್ಡದಾಗಿ ಕಾಣುತ್ತದೆ. ಅವರು ಸಭೆಯ ಕಾರ್ಯಕಲಾಪಗಳನ್ನು ನಡೆಸಲು ಅಡ್ಡಿ ಮಾಡುತ್ತಿಲ್ಲ. ಶ್ರೀ ಚಂದ್ರಕಾಂತ್ ಅವರ ಕೇಸನ್ನು ತಾವು ಪುನಃ ಪರಿಶೀಲಿಸುವುದಾಗಿ ಭರವಸೆ ಕೊಟ್ಟಿದ್ದೀರಿ. ಆದ್ದರಿಂದ ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಇಲ್ಲಿಗೆ ಮುಗಿಸಿ ಮುಂದಿನ ಕಾರ್ಯಕಲಾಪವನ್ನು ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಳ್ಳುವುದು ಒಳ್ಳೆಯದು.

Mr. SPEAKER.—I request the hon. Members to be calm and considerate towards each other and towards the Chair also. I may assure the hon. Members that the Chair has no intention to offend anybody.

Sri K. PRABHAKAR.—Similarly, Members have no intention to offend the Chair also.

Mr. SPEAKER.—I am very glad for that. I do not know why matters are being raised in such an irregular manner. I have not given consent to the hon. Member I do not remember the exact case, When he wanted me to revise my decision, I said that this is not the place for admission. In the first place, the papers are not with me. If he comes to my chamber and if there is a case for revision, I shall certainly revise my decision. Some Members have appealed to my sense of humanity. I may assure them that I am second to none in showing a sense of humanity. In such matters and especially where the interests of weaker sections of the society are concerned. Certain matters are Controlled by Rules. I shall go to the farthest limit to interpret the Rules very liberally so that the members may get opportunities. When we do things, let us do them in a good way. Mahatma Gandhi told us that it is not enough if we do things; he stated that they must be done in a good way; he attached the greatest importance to purity of means. So purity of means is very important and as important or more important than ends. If the hon. Members have any matter to agitate; let them agitate it in a manner which is consistent with dignity and decorum. Let us not create a sort of atmosphere which is likely to produce the effect of obstructing the business. If everybody starts talking confusion prevails. When the Chair has stated that it has an open mind and that it will revise the decision if necessary, the matter should stop at that. I once again appeal to the hon. Members to do good things in a good way according to the procedure laid down in the Rules. I assure the House again that the procedure will be interpreted very liberally. If there is any grievance I shall certainly consider it and do the needful to redress it. Here the matter should stop. Let us proceed to do some good work. Let there be no more points of order.

Sri AZEEZ SAIT.—I have a point of order. Either a Minister or a Member cannot direct the Chair. The Hon. Minister for Parliamentary Affairs who is expected to be quite conversant with parliamentary practices, should set an example to other members, and ought not, by way of raising a point of order, direct the Chair. The Chair has not given a ruling on it. He must also adhere to the rule relating to the point of order and he should not give directions to the Chair or anybody in the House.

Mr. SPEAKER.—The Hon. Minister for Parliamentary Affairs raised a point of order and as every other member, he is also entitled to raise a point of order. While raising a point of order, he brought to my notice that certain things were obstructing the proceedings of the House. I have completely heard him. What he stated was not a direction.

Sri AZEEZ SAIT.—There is discrimination.

Mr. SPEAKER.—There is no discrimination. There was no direction from him. Nobody either on this side or that side can put pressure on me.

Sri N. A. CHANNE GOWDA.—I rise to a point of order.

Mr. SPEAKER.—The leader of the opposition, Sri Sivappa, has already stated everything. There is no need for reiteration.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎನ್. ಎ ಚನ್ನೇಗೌಡ.—ಸ್ವಾಮಿ, ಈ ಸಭೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಪ್ರಜಾಪ್ರಭುತ್ವವನ್ನು ಕೊಲೆ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ನಮ್ಮ ಪಾರ್ಲಿಮೆಂಟರಿ ಶಾಖೆಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳಿಗೆ ನಂಬಂಧಪಟ್ಟಹಾಗೆ ನಾನು ಒಂದು ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಹೇಳಬೇಕಾಗಿದೆ. ಪ್ರಜಾಪ್ರಭುತ್ವದಲ್ಲಿ ಯಾವ ಒಂದು ವಿಷಯವೇ ಆಗಲೀ ಮಾತ ನಾಡುವುದು, ಚರ್ಚೆ ಮಾಡುವುದು ಆ ನಂತರ ಒಂದು ನಿರ್ಣಯಕ್ಕೆ ಬರುವುದು ಇದನ್ನು ನಾವು ಪರಿಪಾಲನೆ ಮಾಡಿಕೊಂಡು ಬಂದಿದ್ದೇವೆ. ನಮ್ಮ ಪಾರ್ಲಿಮೆಂಟರಿ ಶಾಖೆಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಯಾವಾಗಲೂ ಸೌಮ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಮಾತನಾಡುವುದು ಕಂಡುಬರಲಿಲ್ಲ. ಗೂಳಿ ಗುಟುರು ಹಾಕಿದ ಹಾಗೆ ಗುಟುರು ಹಾಕುತ್ತಾರೆ. ಸದಸ್ಯರನ್ನು ಇನ್‌ಸಿನ್ಯುಯೇಟ್ ಮಾಡುವುದು ಇದೆಲ್ಲಾ ಮಾಡುತ್ತಾರೆ. ಇದು ಮಾನ್ಯ ಪಾರ್ಲಿಮೆಂಟರಿ ಶಾಖೆಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಸರಿಯಿಲ್ಲ.

ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರು.—ಅದೆಲ್ಲಾ ಏನು ಬೇಡಿ. ದಯವಿಟ್ಟು ಮಾನ್ಯ ಸದಸ್ಯರು ಕುಳಿತುಕೊಳ್ಳಬೇಕು.

Sri SHARANGOUDA INAMDAR.—The Chair may kindly allot Saturday exclusively for raising points of order. I humbly submit that one day may be allotted for points of order alone so that all the points may be disposed of.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎನ್. ಎ. ಚನ್ನೇಗೌಡ.—ಸ್ವಾಮಿ, ಯಾರಾದರೂ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಸದಸ್ಯರು ತಮ್ಮ ಅಭಿ ಪ್ರಾಯಗಳನ್ನು ವ್ಯಕ್ತಪಡಿಸುವುದಕ್ಕೆ ಹೋದಾಗ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಪಾರ್ಲಿಮೆಂಟರಿ ಶಾಖೆಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಪದೇ ಪದೇ ಎದ್ದು ಆಕ್ಷನ್ ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಳ್ಳಬೇಕು ಎಂದು ಹೇಳುವುದು, ಪೋಷನ್ ಮೂವ್ ಮಾಡುವುದು ಇವೆಲ್ಲಾ ಮಾಡುತ್ತಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಇವರಿಗೆ ತಾಳ್ಮೆ ಎಂಬುದೇ ಇಲ್ಲ. ಅದಕ್ಕೋಸ್ಕರ ವಾಗಿ ನಾನು ಮಾನ್ಯ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರ ಮೂಲಕ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಮುಖ್ಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳನ್ನು ಕೇಳಿಕೊಳ್ಳುತ್ತೇನೆ. ಇವರಿಗೆ ಈ ಖಾತೆಯನ್ನು ತಪ್ಪಿಸಿ ತಾಳ್ಮೆ ಇರುವ ಬೇರೆ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಈ ಪಾರ್ಲಿಮೆಂಟರಿ ಶಾಖೆಯ ಖಾತೆಯನ್ನು ಕೊಡಿ ಎಂದು ನಾನು ಕೇಳಿಕೊಳ್ಳುತ್ತೇನೆ.

Mr. SPEAKER.—There is no point of order. I think the House is inclined to hear the Hon. Chief Minister. The Hon. Chief Minister may continue his overnight speech.